

# The Life of Naşır al-Dīn al-Ḥillī al-Kāshī, a Little-Known Commentator of the *Tajrīd al-‘Aqā’id* Literature, His Academic Lineage, and His Works

Muhammed Yetim\*

*Translated by: Ebrar Akdeniz\*\**

**Abstract:** A leading commentary of Naşır al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī’s *Tajrīd al-‘aqā’id* is Shams al-Dīn al-Işfahānī’s commentary *Tasdīd al-qawā’id fī Sharḥ Tajrīd al-‘aqā’id*. The first annotation (*ḥāshiya*) of this commentary belongs to Naşır al-Dīn al-Ḥillī, who remains largely unknown even now. This book has another important distinction, namely, al-Sayyid al-Sharīf al-Jurjānī’s annotation, the most famous and widespread annotation of *Tasdīd al-qawā’id*, both benefited greatly from and frequently criticized it. The large number of al-Ḥillī’s works found in Istanbul’s libraries also shows that he was a well-known figure among the city’s scholars. Nevertheless, this Imami Shiite scholar’s biography has been neglected until today. This research note introduces an intellectual biography of al-Ḥillī. Although he and al-‘Allāma al-Ḥillī were fellow townsmen and contemporaries, the information about his life, teachers, and students is very limited. This article seeks to enrich this limited biographical information by providing information about his works.

**Keywords:** Kalām, Ḥāshiya, Naşır al-Dīn al-Ḥillī, Biography, *Ḥāshiyat al-Tajrīd*.

\* Res. Assist. Sakarya University, Faculty of Theology.  
Correspondance: muyetim@gmail.com

\*\* MA, Istanbul Medeniyet University, Philosophy Department, Islamic and Turkish Philosophy

## I. Introduction

Over 200 commentaries (*sharḥ*), annotations (*ḥāshiyā*), and notes (*ta'liqāt*) have been written on Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī's (d. 672/1274) *Tajrīd al-'aqā'id*.<sup>1</sup> However, several works, names, and topics are waiting to be studied even though some research has been conducted during the modern period. Two of the best known works are certainly Shams al-Dīn al-Iṣfahānī's (d. 749/1349) *Tasdīd al-qawā'id fi Sharḥ Tajrīd al-'aqā'id* (also known as *Sharḥ-i Qadīm*) and al-Sayyid al-Sharīf al-Jurjānī's (d. 816/1413) *Ḥāshiyat al-Tajrīd*. Al-Jurjānī's annotation was accepted as an independent work within time, and as far as it can be determined, forty-seven secondary annotations and notes were written on it.<sup>2</sup> The other two works of similar reputation and prevalence in the *tajrīd* literature are 'Alī Qūshjī's (d. 879/1474) *al-Sharḥ al-Jadīd* and Jalāl al-Dīn al-Dawwānī's (d. 908/1502) annotation on it. In addition, twenty secondary annotations and notes have been written on al-Dawwānī's annotation.<sup>3</sup> Out of these four works, al-Iṣfahānī's commentary was published completely<sup>4</sup> and Qūshjī's commentary only partly.<sup>5</sup> On the other hand, the annotations of al-Jurjānī and al-Dawwānī have not yet been published in a critical edition.<sup>6</sup>

Even though al-Jurjānī's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrīd* is the most famous annotation written on *Tasdīd al-qawā'id*, it is not the first one. That distinction belongs to Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī (d. 755/1354), who is also the subject of this article. However, neither he nor his annotation have drawn a lot of attention until today. And yet, for the *tajrīd* literature, al-Ḥillī's significance extends beyond the fact that he is its first annotator (*muḥāshshī*). We can summarize this significance and how we discovered it as follows:

- 1 For *tajrīd* literature, see Salih Günaydın, "Nasiruddin et-Tusi'nin Tecridu'l-İ'tikad'ı Üzerine Oluşan Şerh-Hāshiyeler Literatürü: Türkiye Yazma Eser Kütüphanelerinden Bir Bakış," *Journal of Turkish Studies Review* 14/28 (2016): 237-272. As an older study, see this book, which is mainly based on the *tajrīd* literature of Iranian libraries: Ali Sadra'i Hüi, *Kitāb-shināsi-i Tajrīd al-i'tiqād* (Qum: Kitābhāna-i Bozorg-i Hazrat Āyatallah al-'Uzmā Mar'ashi Najafi, 2003).
- 2 For the list of works written on al-Jurjānī's annotation, see Günaydın, "Nasiruddin et-Tusi'nin Tecridu'l-İ'tikad'ı," 256-60.
- 3 For the list of works written on al-Dawwānī's annotation, see *ibid.*, 261-63.
- 4 Shams al-Dīn al-Iṣfahānī, *Tasdīd al-qawā'id fi Sharḥ tajrīd al-'aqā'id*, ed. Khālid b. Ḥammād al-'Adwānī (Kuwait: Dār al-Ḍiyā', 2012).
- 5 'Alā al-Dīn al-Qūshjī, *Sharḥ tajrīd al-'aqā'id*, ed. Muḥammad Ḥusayn al-Zārī'ī al-Riḍā'ī (Qum: Intishārāt Rā'id, 1393 AH).
- 6 We are conducting a critical edition (*taḥqīq*) and translation study on al-Jurjānī's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrīd* as a team with Eşref Altaş, Salih Günaydın, and Muhammet Ali Koca. This work will also include another critical edition of al-Iṣfahānī's *Tasdīd al-qawā'id*, which will be based on older manuscripts than its current critical edition.

One of the things that attracted our attention during our critical edition and translation studies with Eşref Altaş, Muhammet Ali Koca, and Salih Günaydın on al-Jurjānî's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrid* was the constantly repeated notation of "Naşir al-Hillî" in the postscripts (*hāmish*) of the book's manuscripts. The fact that these notations were mentioned repeatedly in the postscripts led us to compare his annotation with that of al-Jurjānî. After completing this comparison, we realized that al-Jurjānî's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrid* is a dialectical text that was directed mostly to Naşir al-Din al-Hillî's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrid*. Our continued comparison enabled us to determine that either by a reference or without a reference, the quotations from al-Hillî and answers that were given to him are far more than those found in the postscripts of the manuscripts.<sup>7</sup> This demonstrates that his ideas were spread through al-Jurjānî by means of quotations and criticisms. Also, as will be seen in the "His Works" section, al-Hillî's *Hāshiyat al-Tajrid* has four different manuscripts, as we could determine in Istanbul's libraries, one of which was specially inscribed for Sultan Mehmed the Conqueror. These findings point out that he was known among Istanbul's scholars in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

The biography of this Shiite scholar draws our attention because his annotation is the first one written on *Tasdid al-qawa'id* and it is used by al-Jurjānî and also because there is a possibility that he was known and read by Ottoman scholars. However, as far as we could determine, the texts about him consist of only a few short articles<sup>8</sup> and a Persian-language biographical text published in Tehran.<sup>9</sup> Therefore, this research will try to introduce a more extended biography by using more resources.

## II. The Life of Naşir al-Din al-Hillî

The full name of this Imami Shiite scholar is Naşir al-Din 'Alî ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Alî al-Kāshî al-Hillî. In various texts, his name sometimes appears with the nickname (*nisba*) *al-Kāshî*, *al-Kāshāni*, or *al-Hillî*. Most of the texts claim that he was born in Kāshān, Iran, around 675/1276, for the exact date appears to be unknown. In fact,

7 Each of these matters that we discovered by comparing the two texts line by line will be pointed out in the footnotes of our critical edition (mentioned before).

8 For three of them, see 'Umar Riḍā Kaḥḥāla, *Mu'jam al-mu'allifin* (Beirut: Maktabat al-muthannā, n.d.), VII, 219-20. *Mawsū'at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā'* (Qum: Muassasa al-Imām al-Şādiq, 1418/1997), VIII,0 159-60; *Mu'jam ṭabaqāt al-mutakallimin* (Qum: Mu'assassa al-Imām al-Şādiq, 1417/1996), III, 131-32.

9 Ḥamid 'Atāi Naẓari, "Naşir al-Din Kāshāni wa nigashta-hā-yi kalāmi-yi Ū," *Āyina-yi Pajūhish* 164 (1396/2017): 119-128.

in a word narrated by his student Ḥaydar al-Āmulī in *Jāmi' al-asrār*, al-Ḥilli uses the expression of “in eighty years of my life...,”<sup>10</sup> which verifies that he lived for at least that long. But still we do not know whether he lived beyond that age. His date of death is registered on a work of al-Ḥilli that was inscribed by his student Ibn al-‘Atā’iqī.<sup>11</sup> Although the *ṭabaqāt* books agree that his birthplace was Kāshān, his coetaneous ‘Imād al-Dīn al-Kāshī (d. after 773/1372) indicates that “his birthplace was Ḥilla but his origins were from Kāshān”<sup>12</sup> at the beginning of his commentary of al-Ḥilli’s *al-Nikāt*. As far as we can determine only the *Biḥār al-anwār* refers to his father. In a note attributed to Shahīd-i Awwal (d. 786/1384), this scholar’s father was Jamāl al-Dīn Abū Ja’far Muḥammad b. ‘Alī al-Kāshī,<sup>13</sup> one of al-Muḥaqqiq al-Ḥilli’s (d. 676/1277) students.<sup>14</sup>

Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī spent most of his life in Ḥilla.<sup>15</sup> He is mentioned among the elders of Imami *faqīhs* and the leading figures of *mutakallimūn* and it is indicated that he was well-educated in logic as well.<sup>16</sup> He was constantly occupied with teaching around Ḥilla and Baghdad.<sup>17</sup> Al-Shushtarī (d. 1019/1610), the author of one of the first comprehensive Shiite *ṭabaqāt* books, uses panegyric statements about him by saying that his level was beyond that of his era’s thinkers and *faqīhs*.<sup>18</sup> Abdallah Afandi (d. 1130/1717) states that he was a scholar at the same level as al-‘Allāma al-Ḥillī (d. 726/1325).<sup>19</sup> However, it is surprisingly difficult to find more information about such a highly praised scholar’s life and academic lineage.

Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī passed away on 10 Rajab 755/31 July 1354 in Najaf.

- 10 Bahā’ al-Dīn Ḥaydar b. ‘Alī Ḥaydar al-Āmulī, *Jāmi' al-asrār wa manba' al-anwār*, ed. Uthmān Ismā’īl Yaḥyā and Henry E. Corbin (Beirut: Muassasat al-Tārīkh al-‘Arabī, 2005), 496.
- 11 Sayyid Muḥammad al-Gharawī, *Mā’a ‘ulamā’ al-Najaf al-ashraf* (Beirut: Dār al-Thaqalayn, n.d.), I, 186.
- 12 ‘Imād al-Dīn Yaḥyā b. Aḥmad al-Kāshī, *Sharḥ al-Nikāt*, The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 1903, 1b.
- 13 Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī, *Biḥār al-anwār al-jāmiā li-durar akhbār al-a’immat al-aḥbār* (Lebanon: Dār Ihyā’ al-Turāth al-‘Arabī, 1983), CIX, 36.
- 14 Muḥammad b. Ḥasan al-Ḥurr al-Āmulī, *Amal al-āmil*, ed. al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī (Qum: Dār al-Kitāb al-Islāmī, 1962), II, 289; al-Mirzā ‘Abd Allāh Afandi al-Iṣfahānī, *Riyāḍ al-‘ulamā’ wa ḥiyāḍ al-fuḍalā’*, ed. al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī (Qum: Maṭba’at al-Khayyām, 1401/1981), V, 143.
- 15 Sayyid Sharif Mar’ashī Ḥusaynī Nūr Allāh al-Shushtarī (Tustarī), *Majālis al-mu’minīn*, (Dār Hishām, n.d.), III, 200.
- 16 Committee, *Mawsū’at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā’*, VIII, 159.
- 17 Al-Shushtarī, *Majālis al-mu’minīn*, III, 201; Shaykh ‘Abbās Qumī, *al-Fawā’id al-Raḍwaiyya fi aḥwāl ‘ulamā’ madhhab al-Ja’fariyya*, ed. Naṣīr Bāqiri Baydahandi (Qum: Muassasa-i Bostān-i Kitāb, 1385/1965), I, 535.
- 18 Al-Shushtarī, *Majālis al-mu’minīn*, III, 200, 201.
- 19 Abdallah Afandi, *Riyāḍ al-ulamā’*, VI, 237.

### III. His Teachers

Some modern texts claim that there is no recorded information about Naşir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī's teachers.<sup>20</sup> Indeed, multiple *ṭabaqāt* books narrate his biography quite briefly and do not mention his teachers. The fact that his father was mentioned among al-Muḥaqqiq al-Ḥillī's students connotes that he might have been educated by his father; however, we encountered no such information in the texts. In that case, did al-Ḥillī take lessons from al-'Allāma al-Ḥillī, who was almost thirty years older, lived in the same city, had a very crowded student circle and studied similar topics with al-Ḥillī as in the case of *tajrīd*? To tell the truth, it is an expected situation, but interestingly neither of the biographies of these two scholars provide any information about it.

During our research, we encountered the names of his three teachers. However, only one is definite, for the other two are probable and improbable, respectively.

i. Jalāl al-Dīn Ja'far b. 'Alī b. Şāhib Dār al-Şakhr al-Ḥusaynī (d. [?]): Al-Ḥillī only studied *ḥadīth* with him.<sup>21</sup>

ii. Burhān al-Dīn 'Abd Allāh ('Ubayd Allāh) b. Muḥammad al-Farghānī al-Tabrizī al-'Ibrī (d. 743/1342):<sup>22</sup> Naşir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī is mentioned as his student in a *ṭabaqāt* book that contains the biography of Burhān al-Dīn al-'Ibrī, one of Quṭb al-Dīn al-Shīrāzī's (d. 710/1311) students.<sup>23</sup> It is possible that this note refers to al-Ḥillī, considering that their ages are suitable for them being linked as teacher and student. However, al-Ḥillī is mentioned as living only in Kāshān, Baghdad, Ḥilla, and Najaf, whereas al-'Ibrī spent most of his life in Tabriz. Yet, it is known that al-'Ibrī was in Baghdad a few times. In that case, the teacher-student relation could have been established during one of his visits. If this relationship is accurate –more data is needed to verify it– al-Ḥillī's academic lineage unites with that of al-Sayyid al-Sharīf al-Jurjānī via Quṭb al-Dīn al-Shīrāzī. This demonstrates that he and al-Jurjānī have a connection in terms of academic lineage, even if not in terms of school.

iii. Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan (d. 771/1369): In the article of "Ḥaydar al-Āmulī," as speaking of Āmulī's teachers, it is said that he took lessons

20 *Mu'jam ṭabaqāt al-mutakallimīn*, III, 132; Ḥāmid 'Atāi Naẓarī, "Naşir al-Dīn Kāshānī," 122.

21 Mīrzā Ḥusayn al-Nūrī al-Ṭabarsī, *Khātimat Mustadrak al-wasā'il* (Beirut: Mu'assassa Āl al-bayt, 2008), II, 324.

22 For the information, see Tahsin Özcan, "İbrī," *DIA*, XXI, 371-72.

23 Shihab al-Dīn Aḥmad b. Yaḥyā ibn Faḍl Allāh al-'Umārī, *Masālik al-abşār fī mamālik al-amşār*, ed. Kāmil Salmān al-Jubūrī and Mahdī al-Najm (Lebanon: Dār al-Kütüb al-'Ilmiyya, 2010), IX, 132.

from “Fakhr al-Muhaqqiqin Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan and his student Naṣir al-Dīn al-Kāshānī.”<sup>24</sup> It can therefore be deduced from this statement that Fakhr al-Muhaqqiqin was al-Ḥillī’s teacher, and yet we could locate no supporting information in the texts. Considering that Fakhr al-Muhaqqiqin, a son of the famous al-‘Allāma al-Ḥillī, was born in 682/1283 and was at least seven years younger than Naṣir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī, one must be careful about this information.

#### IV. His Students

The texts’ inadequacy in terms of providing information about Naṣir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī’s teachers is also evident when it comes to his students. Among the sources, we found that almost all of the works that contain his own biography refer only to those of his students who studied *ḥadīth* with him. However, one modern study does mention his other students.<sup>25</sup> According to this text, his certain and probable students are listed below.

i. Bahā’ al-Dīn Ḥaydar b. ‘Alī al-Āmulī (d. 787/1385): Born in Āmul, northern Iran, he was educated in Astarābād and Iṣfahan. After serving as the vizier of Ṭabaristān for a while, he withdrew from politics and engaged in Islamic mysticism (Sufism) by living in seclusion. During his return from a hajj trip, he spent some time in Baghdad to take lessons from al-‘Allāma al-Ḥillī’s son Fakhr al-Muhaqqiqin Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan and Naṣir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī. He spent the rest of his life in Najaf and wrote many books. Āmulī, who was regarded as an authority in *tafsīr*, *ḥadīth*, *fiqh*, and *kalām*, is known for his attempt to combine Sufism’s theory of the unity of being (*waḥdat al-wujūd*) with Shiism. Because of his works that are acknowledged by Shiites in this field, he is called “Sayyid al-muta’allihīn.”<sup>26</sup>

ii. ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. al-‘Atā’iqī (d. after 786/1384): His full name is Kamāl al-Dīn ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. Muḥammad b. Ibrāhīm al-Ḥillī, and his known nickname is Ibn al-‘Atā’iqī.<sup>27</sup> He received this nickname, which refers to a village near Ḥilla,<sup>28</sup>

24 Ethem Cebecioğlu, “Haydar el-Āmulī,” *DIA*, XVII, 26.

25 Committee, *Mawsū‘at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā’*, VIII, 159.

26 Ethem Cebecioğlu, “Haydar el-Āmulī,” 26-27.

27 Bagdatlı İsmā‘il Pashā, *İdāḥ al-maknūn fi al-dhayl ‘alā Kashf al-zunūn*, 1: 49. Al-Sayyid Muḥsin al-Amin, *A’yān al-Shi‘a*, ed. Ḥasan al-Amin (Beirut: Dār al-Ta‘āruf, 1983), 2:268; ‘Abbās Qumī, *al-Fawā’id al-Raḍwāiyya*, 1: 387.

28 Aqa Bozorg al-Ṭahrānī, *al-Dhari‘a ilā taṣānif al-Shi‘a* (Beirut: Dār al-Aḍwā, 1983), 1: 365.

because his grandfather was from that village.<sup>29</sup> We found no death date for him, but he was known to be alive in 786/1384, for that date was the license (*ijāza*) register that he noted on a manuscript of his work *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāgha*'s third volume for his students who read the book to him,<sup>30</sup> and probably was the date given by the texts based on this information. His real reputation is in linguistics, though. Al-Khwansārī, the author of *Rawḍāt al-jannāt*, names two of his teachers<sup>31</sup> but does not mention al-Ḥillī as being among them. However, Muḥsin al-Amīn, the author of *A'yān al-Shi'a*, shares this information,<sup>32</sup> which is also repeated in a contemporary study.<sup>33</sup> In addition, one of Ibn al-'Atā'iḳī's works, entitled *Shuhda*, is the commentary he wrote on al-Ḥillī's *Ta'rib al-Zubda* which was a translation of Naşir al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī's book about astronomy (*'ilm al-hay'a*).<sup>34</sup> Ibn al-'Atā'iḳī also wrote a copy of *al-Nikāt*, his teacher's book on logic, in his teacher's dictation and later recorded his teacher's death on this book.<sup>35</sup> The source of our knowledge about al-Ḥillī's death is this very note. Al-'Atā'iḳī mentions him as "our *mawlā* and our *shaykh*." When this is considered with other data, it can be accepted as proof of their teacher-student relationship.

iii. Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Sadqa b. Ḥusayn (d. [?]): He read Qāḍī al-Bayḍāwī's *Miṣbāḥ al-Arwāḥ*, a small *kalām* work, with Naşir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī.<sup>36</sup> Muḥsin al-Amīn gives a headline for this person – we could find no distinct biography about him – but just states that he was one of al-Ḥillī's students and says no more about his life. He indicates that the manuscript this person read is in Maktaba-i Gharawiyya and that a register of reading (*al-qirā'a*) proves that by the handwriting of Naşir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī on the front page (*zahriya*) of the manuscript.<sup>37</sup> The date given for the reading completion was 5 Jumādā al-ūlā 725/19 April 1325.

29 Allāmah Muḥammad 'Alī Mudarris Tabrizī, *Rayḥānat al-adab* (Tehran: Kitāb-furūshī Khayyām, 1374), 8:106.

30 Muḥammad Bāqir al-Khwansārī, *Rawḍāt al-jannāt fī aḥwāl 'ulamā' wa-l-sādāt* (Qum: Maktabat Ismā'iliyān, 1391/1971), 4:194. Bagdadli Ismā'il Pasha accidentally marks the date of 786 as the assignation (*faragh*) date of aforesaid commentary (see *Hadiyyat al-'arifīn*, 1:528). However, the texts from which this note was cited mark this book's assignation date as 780.

31 Al-Khwansārī, *Rawḍāt al-jannāt*, IV, 193.

32 Muḥsin al-Amīn, *A'yān al-Shi'a*, VIII, 309.

33 Committee, *Mawsū'atu ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā'*, VIII, 159.

34 Muḥsin al-Amīn, *A'yān al-Shi'a*, VIII, 309. The critical edition of this commentary was published by Shu'bat Iḥyā' al-Turāth wa-l-Taḥqīq, a publishing company operated by the institution of 'Atabat al-'Ulwiyya al-Muqaddasa in Najaf in 2018.

35 Muḥsin al-Amīn, *A'yān al-Shi'a*, VIII, 309.

36 Committee, *Mawsū'at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā'*, VIII, 159.

37 Muḥsin al-Amīn, *A'yān al-Shi'a*, IX, 374.

iv. Tāj al-Dīn Muḥammad b. al-Qāsim b. Mu‘iyya al-Ḥasanī (d. [?]): He studied *ḥadīth* with al-Ḥilli.<sup>38</sup>

v. Jalāl al-Dīn ‘Abd Allāh b. Sharafshāh al-Ḥusaynī (d. [?]): He also studied *ḥadīth* with al-Ḥilli.<sup>39</sup>

vi. ‘Imād al-Dīn Yaḥyā al-Kāshī (d. after 773/1372): Even though there is a notation that al-Ḥilli’s *al-Nikāt* was written for Yaḥyā al-Kāshī,<sup>40</sup> which shows that they did have a connection, we do not have enough information to claim that this was a teacher-student relationship. Considering that al-Ḥilli was at least seventy-seven years old when he wrote this book in 752/1371-72, and that al-Kāshī, whose date of birth and death are unknown, was writing books twenty-one years after this date,<sup>41</sup> there is a possible age gap for such a relationship. Although we cannot be sure that it existed, we can definitely say that he was at least influenced by and benefited from al-Ḥilli. Indeed, al-Kāshī wrote a commentary on *al-Nikāt*, which al-Ḥilli wrote for him. At the beginning of the commentary, he talks about al-Ḥilli in a voice full of respect and gratitude. This will be addressed in the next chapter again.

## V. His Works

Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥilli wrote the following works.

i. *Ḥāshiya ‘alā Tasdīd al-qawā‘id sharḥ Tajrid al-‘aqā‘id*: An annotation written on the first five chapters of Iṣfahānī’s six-chapter commentary, it excludes the final chapter, which discusses eschatology (*ma‘ād*). Al-Jurjānī directed his own annotation toward al-Ḥilli’s either by quoting from or objecting to it. Although we did not scan the manuscripts of this annotation in detail, we did manage to identify four manuscripts in Istanbul alone, two in the Beyazıt Manuscript Library, one in the library of Marmara University’s Faculty of Theology, and the last one in the Library of Ahmed III in Topkapı Palace. The manuscripts in the libraries of Beyazıt<sup>42</sup> and Topkapı Palace<sup>43</sup> do not have a date of inscription, whereas the one in the library of Marmara University’s Faculty of Theology is dated 839 AH.<sup>44</sup> The

38 Committee, *Mawsū‘at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā’*, VIII, 160.

39 Committee, *Mawsū‘at ṭabaqāt al-fuqahā’*, VIII, 160.

40 Muḥsin al-Amin, *A’yān al-Shī‘a*, VIII, 309.

41 Mehmet Arıkan, “‘Imādüddin el-Kāshī,” <https://www.islamdusunceatlası.org/detail/person463>.

42 Beyazıt Manuscript Library, Veliyüddin Efendi 2047 and 2058.

43 The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 1741.

44 The Library of Faculty of Theology of Marmara University YZ759.



manuscript in the Library of Ahmed III Collection was one of the manuscripts prepared for Sultan Mehmed the Conqueror's observation, which gives us a solid opinion about this annotation's reputation among Istanbul's scholars.

Al-Ḥillī's annotation was also highly appreciated by the Imami Shiites, especially due to his discussion of the imamate. Al-Shushtari claims that al-Ḥillī makes strong counter-arguments here against al-Işfahānī's refutations. He even claims that 'Alī al-Qūshjī, author of *al-Sharḥ al-Jadīd*, did not address Işfahānī's refutations because he saw that al-Ḥillī's answers were too strong and thus had no desire to deal with them.<sup>45</sup> Yet, since al-Shushtari's words are not based on any concrete indications, his claim about 'Alī al-Qūshjī's hesitation is baseless. Besides, al-Shushtari revealed his sectarian bigotry many times, such as when he declared Quṭb al-Dīn al-Rāzī and al-Jurjānī Shiites without providing any proof. Therefore, one must be careful about his assessments.

ii. *Sharḥ Ṭawālī' al-anwār*: This is one of the commentaries written on al-Bayḍāwī's famous *Ṭawālī' al-anwār*. Al-Ṭahrānī, the author of *al-Dharī'a*, says that he saw this book in Khizānat-i Gharawiyya in Najaf in the form of a manuscript endowed here by Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd Allāh b. Sharafshāh in 810 AH and also indicates that another manuscript of this book is in Khorasan's al-Maktabat al-Raḍawiyya.<sup>46</sup>

iii. *Al-Nikāt fī masā'il imtiḥāniyya fī 'ilmay al-mantiq wa-l-kalām*: As the name implies, this work includes logic and *kalām* issues and was written for 'Imād al-Dīn Yaḥyā al-Kāshī. Al-Ḥillī completed it three years before his death in 752 AH. The author of *A'yan al-Shi'a* states that the manuscript of this book inscribed by al-Ḥillī's student Ibn al-'Atā'iḳī in al-Ḥillī's dictation is in Najaf's Khizānat-i Gharawiyya (al-Maktabat al-Ḥaydariyya).<sup>47</sup> This manuscript's front page (*zahriya*) is the one that is marked with al-Ḥillī's death date. Al-Kāshī wrote a commentary on this book, which was written for him. One of the two manuscripts of this commentary that we had the chance to examine is in Ahmed III 1903 in the Library of Topkapi Palace and the other one is in Fatih 3288, 123b-162b in the Suleymaniye Library.

iv. *Fawā'id 'alā Ṭahrīr al-qawā'id al-mantiqiyya fī Sharḥ al-Shamsiyya*: Quṭb al-Dīn al-Rāzī's (d. 766/1365) famous commentary *al-Shamsiyya* was a *fawā'id* text

45 Al-Shushtari, *Majālis al-mu'minin*, III, 201.

46 Al-Ṭahrānī, *al-Zaria*, XIII, 365.

47 Muḥsin al-Amin, *A'yan al-Shi'a*, VIII, 309. The register of this manuscript is Najaf, al-Maktabat al-Ḥaydariyya 670.

written on *Tahrir al-qawā'id al-mantiqiyya*. One should note here that al-Ḥilli wrote a *fawā'id* text on al-Rāzī's commentary, who was presumed to be almost twenty years younger than him. Indeed, as we indicated above, al-Ḥilli was born in 675/1276, whereas al-Rāzī was estimated to be born in 692/1293.<sup>48</sup> Al-Ḥilli contented himself with making only short objections and was not wordy in this text.

The *ṭabaqāt* author Abdallah Afandi states that al-Sayyid al-Sharif al-Jurjāni answers some of these objections in his *Ḥāshiya 'alā Tahrir al-qawā'id* as in the case of *Ḥāshiya 'alā Tajrīd*.<sup>49</sup> A manuscript of this annotation, which contains no inscription register, is kept in Ayasoyfa 2528, 20b-35a in the Suleymaniye Library. Comparing this manuscript with al-Rāzī's commentary and al-Jurjāni's annotation proves that Afandi's statement is true. This needs to be kept in mind in terms of determining al-Jurjāni's sources while studying his annotation, because he does not mention any name while answering the objections. Instead, he contents himself with using such phrases "*qīla/qīla 'alayhi* (be said/be said on)."

v. *Ḥāshiya 'alā Ma'ārij al-fahm fī sharḥ al-Naẓm*: He wrote this annotation of al-'Allāma al-Ḥilli's commentary *Ma'ārij al-Fahm fī sharḥ al-Naẓm*, which he wrote on his own brief *aqā'id* text entitled *Naẓm al-barāhīn fī uṣūl al-Dīn*. Ṭabaṭabā'i only mentions this annotation of al-Ḥilli out of eleven manuscripts of the commentary that he found.<sup>50</sup>

vi. *Ḥāshiya 'alā Sharḥ al-Ishārāt*: This is an annotation of al-Ṭūsi's *Sharḥ al-Ishārāt*. Some sources give its title as *Ta'liqāt 'alā ḥawāmish Sharḥ al-Ishārāt*<sup>51</sup>; however, the title we use seems to be more suitable. Besides, our examination of a manuscript of the book that we reviewed demonstrates that the book is both a direct annotation of some passages of Ṭūsi's commentary and includes all three parts of the *al-Ishārāt*, namely, logic, physic, and metaphysics.<sup>52</sup> This manuscript is also one of those inscribed for the observation of Sultan Mehmed the Conqueror.<sup>53</sup>

48 The estimation about Quṭb al-Dīn al-Rāzī's birth date is based on Taj al-Dīn al-Subkī (d. 771/1370), who says that al-Rāzī died in 766 AH when he was around 74 years old. (Tāj al-Dīn al-Subkī, *Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya al-kubrā*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥammad al-Ṭanāhī and 'Abd al-Fattāḥ Muḥammad al-Ḥulvī [Cairo: Maṭba'at 'Īsā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī, 1964/1383], IX, 275.) This information, which was mentioned by al-Subkī, who met al-Rāzī in person in Damascus, expresses a strong testimony about the date of al-Rāzī's death; however, he gives no any certainty about his age by using the word *naḥwa* (around).

49 Abdallah Afandi, *Riyāḍ al-'ulamā'*, IV, 181.

50 'Abd al-'Azīz Jawād Ṭabaṭabā'i, *Maktabat al-Allāma al-Ḥilli* (n.p.: Mu'assassa Āl-i al-Bayt, 1416/1995), 191.

51 Al-Ṭahrānī, *al-Dhari'a*, VI, 112. Abdallah Afandi, *Riyāḍ al-'ulamā'*, IV, 181.

52 The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 3220.

53 I am thankful to Mehmet Arıkan for informing me of the manuscripts of *Ḥāshiya al-Tajrīd* and *Ḥāshiya al-Ishārāt* in the collection of Ahmed III.

vii. *Risāla fī naqd al-'Allāma al-Ḥillī fī ta'rifihī li-l-Ṭahāra min Kitāb al-qawā'id*: This treatise consists of the twenty objections to the definition of cleanliness (*ṭahāra*) made by al-'Allāma al-Ḥillī in his *fiqh* book *Qawā'id al-aḥkām fī ma'rifat al-ḥalāl wa-l-ḥarām*. Afandi states that this now-lost treatise is both famous and widespread.<sup>54</sup> However, these objections survived until today because they were addressed in a work of Shahīd-i Awwāl.<sup>55</sup> Looking at the objections in question shows that they are coherent with the definition technique of the logic. Their common point is that al-'Allāma al-Ḥillī's definition does not meet the conditions of *ittirād* and *in'iqās*. Thus, the treatise is important because it is an example of applying logic to the terms of *fiqh* and displays Naşir al-Dīn al-Ḥillī's ability to use the rules of logic. After mentioning these objections, Shahīd-i Awwāl tries to respond seventeen of them. Shahīd-i Şānī (d. 966/1559 [?]), on the other hand, asserts in *Sharḥ al-qawā'id* that al-Ḥillī's objections are quite strong (*ghāyat al-jawda*), whereas Shahīd-i Awwāl's answers are constrained (*awjiba mutakallifa*).<sup>56</sup>

viii. *Ta'rib Zubdat al-idrāk fī 'ilm al-aflāk*: This Arabic translation of al-Ṭūsī's Persian-language book on *'ilm al-hay'a*, entitled *Zubdat al-idrāk fī 'ilm al-aflāk*, is registered as also being in the Hizānat-i Gharawiyya.<sup>57</sup> This library's online catalog, which currently offers services in Najaf under the name of al-Maktabat al-Raḍawiyya al-Ḥaydariyya, is quite inattentive and inadequate. Therefore, we could not determine if the aforesaid works *al-Nikāt*, *Sharḥ Ṭawāli'*, and this translation are still there. However, *Shuhda fī sharḥ Ta'rib al-Zubda*, a manuscript of the commentary of this translation written by his student Ibn al-'Atā'iqī, is there.<sup>58</sup>

ix. *Mūsil al-ṭālibīn ilā sharḥ Nahj al-Mustarshidīn*: This is a commentary on al-'Allāma al-Ḥillī's *Nahj al-Mustarshidīn*. *Ṭabaqāt* books do not mention this commentary. However, Ḥāmid 'Aṭā'i Nazārī, a contemporary Iranian researcher, claims, based on the manuscripts he has identified, that al-Ḥillī has a work by this name.<sup>59</sup> The same researcher also wrote an article about the manuscript, which

54 Abdallah Afandi, *Riyāq al-'ulamā'*, IV, 181.

55 Shahid Awwāl Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Makkī, *Ghāyat al-murād fī Sharḥ Nukat al-irshād* (Qum: Markaz al-abḥāth wa al-dirāsāt al-Islāmiyya, 1414/1993), I, 21-23.

56 Shahid Thānī Zayn al-Dīn b. 'Alī al-Jubā'i al-Āmili, *Fawā'id al-qawā'id*, ed. Sayyid Abū al-Ḥasan Maṭṭlabī (Qum: Daftar-i Tabliḡhāt-ı Islāmī, 1419/1998), I, 13.

57 Muḥsin al-Amin, *A'yān al-Shi'a*, VIII, 309.

58 Najaf, al-Maktabat al-Raḍawiyya al-Ḥaydariyya 29630. The book's name was miswritten in the online catalog as *al-Shuhda fī taqribat al-Zubda*.

59 Ḥāmid 'Aṭā'i Nazārī, "Naşir al-Dīn Kaşhānī," 124.

he discovered in Hasan Hüsnü Paşa collection and had been registered with the archive number 1153 in Istanbul's Süleymaniye Library.<sup>60</sup>

Even though we encountered the *Sharḥ Kitāb Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī al-Kāshī fi 'ilm al-jadal*, attributed to 'Imād al-Dīn al-Kāshī, in the online catalog searches, after our research we determined that it is not a work on the science of dialectics (*jadal*), but rather a manuscript of the above-mentioned *Sharḥ al-Nikāt*.

## Conclusion

As can be seen in this brief biography, which uses the available resources as much as possible, the sources do not provide us with enough information about Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī's life. Thus, it is hard to get an answer from the biographies to the question of why al-Jurjānī's *Ḥāshiyā al-Tajrīd* and *Ḥāshiyā 'alā Tahṛīr al-qawā'id* are directed especially to al-Ḥillī's annotations. Al-Shushtarī, a *ṭabaqāt* author, declares that al-Jurjānī uses his *Ḥāshiyā al-Tajrīd* as a tool for inquiry,<sup>61</sup> but remains silent about the fact that al-Jurjānī responds to al-Ḥillī on many matters. Therefore, he gives no information about the reason of this discoursing. However, the passages that we found and compared from Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ḥillī's *Ḥāshiyā al-Tajrīd* during our aforesaid critical edition study, as well as our superficial examinations his other works, demonstrate that he exhibits strong investigations and criticisms in the topics with which he deals. Maybe the answer we are looking for is to be found within the strength of these criticisms. Thus, wider and more detailed work must be undertaken in order to answer the question.

## References

- 'Āmili, Muḥammad b. Ḥassan al-Hurr. *Amal al-āmil*, I-II, ed. al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Husaynī. Qum: Dār al-Kitāb al-Islāmī, 1962.
- 'Āmili, Shahīd Thānī Zayn al-Dīn. *Fawā'id al-qawā'id*, ed. Sayyid Abu al-Ḥasan Maṭlabī. Qum: Daftar-i Tabliḡāt-ı Islāmī, 1419/1998.
- Āmulī, Bahā' al-Dīn Ḥaydar. *Jāmi' al-asrār wa manba' al-anwār*, ed. 'Uthmān Ismā'īl Yaḥyā and Henry E. Corbin. Beirut: Muassasat al-Tārīḡ al-'Arabi, 2005.
- Amin, Muhsin. *A'yānu's-Şi'a*, I-X, ed. Ḥasan al-Amin. Beirut: Dār al-Ta'āruḡ, 1983.

60 Ḥāmid 'Aṭā'i Naṣārī, "Dast nawishti-i tāzayāb az Mūşil al-ṭālibin-i Naṣīr al-Dīn-i Kāshānī," *Āyina-yi Pajūhash* 164 (1396/2017): 129-136.

61 Al-Shushtarī, *Majālis al-mu'minin*, 3: 201.

- Arıkan, Mehmet. "İmâdüddin el-Kâşî", <https://www.islamdusunceatlası.org/detail/person463>, (10 Ocak 2019).
- Cebecioğlu, Ethem. "Haydar el-Âmülî". *DİA*, XVII, 26-27.
- Committee, *Mawsû'at tabaqât al-fuqahâ'*, I-XIV. Qum: Mu'assasat al-Imâm al-Şâdiq, 1418/1997.
- Gharawî, Sayyid Muḥammad. *Ma'a 'ulamâ' al-Najaf al-ashraf*, I-II. Beirut: Dâr al- Thaqalayn, n.d.
- Günaydın, Salih. "Nasiruddin et-Tüsî'nin *Tecridu'l-i'tikâd*'ı Üzerine Oluşan Şerh-Hâşiye Literatürü: Türkiye Yazma Eser Kütüphanelerinden Bir Bakış". *Journal of Turkish Studies Review* XIV/28 (2016), 237-72.
- Hillî, Naşir al-Din. *Hâshiya 'alâ Sharḥ al-Ishârât*, The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 3220.
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Hâshiya 'alâ Tasdîd al-qawâ'id Sharḥ Tajrid al-'aqâ'id*. Beyazıt Manuscript Library, Veliyüddin Efendi 2047.
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Hâshiya 'alâ Tasdîd al-qawâ'id Sharḥ Tajrid al-'aqâ'id*. Beyazıt Manuscript Library, Veliyüddin Efendi 2058.
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Hâshiya 'alâ Tasdîd al-qawâ'id Sharḥ Tajrid al-'aqâ'id*. The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 1741.
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Hâshiya 'alâ Tasdîd al-qawâ'id Sharḥ Tajrid al-'aqâ'id*. The Library of Faculty of Theology of Marmara University YZ759.
- Hüi, 'Ali Sadrâi. *Kitâb shinâsi-i Tajrid al-i'tiqâd*. Qum: Kitâbhâne-i Bozorg-i Hazrat-i Âyatallah al-'Uzmâ' Mar'ashi Najafi, 2003.
- Ibn 'Atâi'qî, 'Abd al-Rahman. *al-Shuhda fî Sharḥ Ta'rib al-Zubda*. Najaf al-Maktabat al-Raḍawiyya al-Ḥaydariyya 29630.
- Işfahânî, 'Abd Allâh Afandi. *Riyâḍ al-'ulamâ' wa ḥiyâḍ al-fuḍalâ'*, I-VII, ed. al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynî. Qum: Maṭba'at al-Khayyâm, 1401/1981.
- Kâşî, 'Imâd al-Din Yahyâ. *Sharḥ al-Nikât*. The Library of Topkapı Palace, Ahmed III 1903.
- Kaḥḥâlâ, 'Umar Riḍâ. *Mu'jam al-mu'allifin*, I-XV. Beirut: Maktabat al-Muthannâ, n.d.
- Khwansârî, Muḥammad Bâqir, *Rawḍat al-jannât fî aḥwâl 'ulamâ' wa-l-sâdât*, I-VIII. Qum: Maktabat Ismâ'iliyan, 1391/1971.
- Komisyon. *Mu'jam tabaqât al-mutakallimin*, I-V. Qum: Mu'assasat al-Imâm al-Şâdiq, 1417.
- Qumî, Shaykh 'Abbâs. *al-Fawâ'id al-Raḍawiyya fî aḥwâl 'ulamâ' madhhab al-Jafariyya*, I-II, ed. Nâsir Bâqirî Baydahandi. Qum: Mu'assasa-i Bustân-ı Kitâb, 1385/1965.
- Majlisî, Muḥammad Bâqir. *Biḥâr al-anwâr al-jâmi'a li-durar akhbâr al-a'immat al-aṭḥâr*, I-CX. Lebanon: Dâr Ihyâ' al-Turâth al-'Arabi 1983.
- Mudarris Tabrizî, Muḥammad 'Ali. *Rayḥânât al-adab fî tarâjim al-ma'rûfin bi-l-kunya aw al-laqab*, I-VIII. Tehran: Kitâb furûshi Khayyâm, 1374.
- Nazarî, Hamid Atâ'î. "Dast nawashti-i tâzayâb az Mûsil al-tâlibin-i Naşir al-Din Kâshânî", *Âyina-yi Pajuhish* CLXIV (1396/2017), 129-136.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Naşir al-Din Kâshânî wa nigashta-hâ-yi kalâmi-yi Ô", *Âyina-yi Pazhuhish* CLXIV (1396/2017), 119-128.
- 'Umari, Shihâb al-Din Aḥmad. *Masâlik al-absâr fî mamâlik al-amşâr*, I-XXVII, ed. Kâmil Salmân al-Jubûri and Mahdi al-Najm. Lebanon: Dâr al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, 2010.
- Özcan, Tahsin. "İbri", *DİA*, XXI, 371-372.
- Shahid Awwal Shams al-Din Muḥammad. *Ghâyat al-murâd fî Sharḥ Nukat al-irshâd*, I-IV. Qum: Markaz al-abḥâth wa al-dirâsât al-Islâmiyya, 1414/1993.
- Shushtari (Tustari), Nur Allah. *Majâlis al-mu'minin*, I-VI. n.p.: Dâr Hishâm, n.d.

## NAZARIYAT

Subkî, Tâj al-Din. *Ṭabaqât al-Shâfi'iyya al-kubrâ*, I-X, ed. Maḥmûd Muḥammad al-Ṭanâhî and 'Abd al-Fattah Muḥammad al-Ḥulv. Cairo: Maṭba'at 'Isâ al-Bâbî al-Ḥalabî, 1964/1383.

Ṭabaṭabâ'î, 'Abd al-'Aziz Jawâd. *Maktabat al-'Allâma al-Ḥilli*. n.p.: Mu'assasat Âl al-Bayt, 1416/1995.

Ṭabarsî, Mîrza Ḥusayn. *Khâtimat Mustadrak al-wasâ'il*, I-IX. Beirut: Mu'assasat Âl al-Bayt, 2008.

Ṭahrâni, Aqa Bozorg. *al-Dhari'a ilâ taṣâniif al-Shi'a*, I-XXV. Beirut: Dâr al-Aḍwâ', 1983.